Staffing in the Public Service

Athens, Khartoum
November 2008
Staffing in the Public Service

Athens, Khartoum
November 2008
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>INTRODUCTION</strong></td>
<td><strong>7</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>CHAPTER 1:</strong> Guiding principles for staffing procedures in the public service</td>
<td><strong>9</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>CHAPTER 2:</strong> E.U. Member states recruitment systems</td>
<td><strong>19</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>CHAPTER 3:</strong> The situation in Sudan</td>
<td><strong>55</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>CHAPTER 4:</strong> Lessons learned from the international experience: three case studies</td>
<td><strong>75</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>CONCLUSION</strong></td>
<td><strong>113</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY</strong></td>
<td><strong>117</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTRODUCTION

The present manual on staffing and recruiting issues was prepared within the framework of the project “Training Trainers in Good Governance”, a human resource development program addressed to Sudanese non governmental sector organizations. The project has been implemented by the Centre for European Constitutional Law and the Khartoum International Centre for Human Rights with the financial support of Hellenic Aid. The manual complements a training program on similar topics so as to diffuse sound staffing principles to a broader audience in the Sudanese non governmental and public sectors.

The first chapter contains a short exposé of the main contemporary recruiting and staffing principles. The following chapter depicts the European experience on staffing issues through a compilation of twenty five country profiles. The third chapter portrays the current situation in Sudan by analyzing the legal framework that governs the recruitment and staffing procedures in the Sudanese public sector. Finally, the fourth chapter discusses the positive aspects and the challenges of international staffing practices by presenting three case-studies: the American, Australian and South African staffing and recruitment systems.
CHAPTER 1:
GUIDING PRINCIPLES FOR STAFFING PROCEDURES
IN THE PUBLIC SERVICE

Staffing is considered as one of the seven most important managerial functions (jointly with planning, organizing, directing, coordinating, reviewing and budgeting). It deals with finding the right people for each specific position within a given organization and influences all aspects of organizational functioning and performance. Staffing comprises a number of interrelated activities such as estimations of personnel needs, definition of competencies, selection and recruitment methods, deployment and remuneration systems, promotion and career handling, training and development practices, performance evaluation mechanisms, discipline and separation procedures\(^1\). In order to manage such a complicated and multidimensional framework a holistic approach is required as

---
Recruitment is considered the cornerstone of staffing as far as the other related functions, such as promotion, development etc. depend on the quality of the incoming HR.

Effective recruitment in the public service involves elaborated human resource strategies\(^2\) and trustworthy institutional structures. Each public service must consider a staffing and HR management system, suitable for its specific characteristics. Some public administrations manage their staff through a career system while others adopt a job or employment system. Briefly, a career system offers systematic hierarchical advancement opportunities while a job or employment system doesn’t.

\(^2\) Committee of Experts on Public Administration (2003), *Strategies for high-quality staffing in the public sector*, United Nations
According to Francisco Cardona⁴ the established personnel management system in a given administration influences the recruitment procedures. Career systems recruit through examinations testing mainly the knowledge of candidates required to hold academic credentials particularly in disciplines such as public law, constitutional law, administrative law, organisational theory and methodology, public finance, accounting and taxation, budgetary systems etc. These generic topics can go together with subjects relevant to the specific vacancies to be filled, for instance education policies, social security, labour issues etc. Candidates are recruited following their score. Entry examinations take place at the opening of a career itinerary while promotion permits hierarchical progress generating a career path specific to a given civil servant. A probation stage, lasting from some months to few years, usually follows career system recruitment. Throughout this phase the new recruitee partakes in on –the- job training, tutoring by a senior colleague and other learning activities. At the end of this period, subsequent to formal evaluation of his/her adaptation and performance, the appointee can be either confirmed as a permanent civil servant or dropped for incompetence.

On the contrary, employment systems aim at selecting candidates not for a career but specifically for a certain position. Therefore, besides the examination of academic knowledge, employment recruitment procedures assess in addition previous experience, professional aptitude, psychological features etc.

⁴ Cardona F. (1998), Structural Elements for Recruitment in European Civil Service Systems, SIGMA
so as to assure a satisfactory job performance for a particular position. The employment systems recruitment combines knowledge and skills control, previous experience assessment, interviews and psychometric tests and can be complemented with a probationary stage, aiming at appraising the applicant’s response to the job requirements.

These two main models can be combined in several ways producing amalgamated solutions. For instance, in certain cases, one can become a public employee either through career system examinations or through previous experience assessment, interviews and psychometric tests or, even through a mixed procedure combining knowledge tests at a first stage followed by professional experience and psychological features assessment against a standardized set of metrics, for those who succeed the initial knowledge examination. The final note is calculated by totalling the separate scores of the knowledge and the assessment tests, generally unequally weighted. Contestants are usually evaluated either by specialized bodies (e.g. the Greek ASEP) or by commissions including representatives of the recruiting agencies and independent experts. In special cases non-standard work arrangements (NSWAs) can be used for public sector staffing. NSWAs are those other than full-time, permanent positions, e.g., seasonal, part-time, temporary agency work on-call, and those that involve staff whose services are acquired via a contractual arrangement with another organization. Alternative work

---

5 Cardona, op.cit
arrangements have to respect equity, equal access and best applicant selection principles as well as employees’ legal rights\textsuperscript{6}.

Despite the diverse methodological approaches adopted by different administrative systems, there are some fundamental features common to any effective staffing schemes, as summarized below\textsuperscript{7}:

1. Human resource (HR) planning and management systems must be based on long-term order for the HR planning, staffing and management functions to be fulfilled, specialized units, properly resourced by human resource management professionals need to be put in place. Unfortunately in many developing countries, HR functions have been left to non-professionals. There should be deliberate and sustained programmes to develop strong cadres of human resource management professionals in the public sector.

   In view of such a necessity, one must consider a number of specific issues. Public administrations are not made up from a unique profession but from term strategies, precise baseline data and clear forecasts of professional requirements. In many divergent businesses determined by highly differentiated types of jobs, tasks and sub-tasks to be performed and, therefore, many sub-strategies have to be taken into account. Under a framework approach, one can subdivide broad HR strategies into a number of sub-strategies enhancing an overall career system and defining all kind


\textsuperscript{7} UN Committee of Experts on Public Administration, op.cit and Cardona, op.cit
of vacancies necessary for the tasks to be performed. Jobs can be sub-divided to long-term and short-term. The former ensure continuity and confidentiality that are critical determinants of the steering role of the State, and rely upon long-term performance. The latter applies to skills for clearly defined tasks over limited periods of time similar to those used in the private sector. This distinction calls attention to the need of a hybrid system, a combination of career and job / employment practices.

2. Adequately educated and skilled people are very important for professional public services. The merit principle for recruitment and promotions in public jobs requires academic qualifications and experience, rather than political or social affiliations. Once professionals are recruited, they should be protected from political dismissals and interference in their work. Public services in many developing countries are staffed by people without the academic and professional qualifications that are needed to carry out the work. This is particularly the case with certain professions such as management, accounting, auditing, etc. while such situations may be worsened by political and social pressures.

3. The staffing systems of contemporary public administrations have to be based on two main principles, namely (a) equal access for all duly qualified candidates and (b) selection of the best applicants. Administrative systems belonging to the southern European legalistic traditions like France, Italy, Belgium Spain, Portugal, Greece, but also Southern
American and francophone African countries, concentrate on the equal access principle, while administrations following Anglo-Saxon tradition such as the USA, Canada, Australia, New Zealand, the Netherlands and the Nordic European countries⁸, lay emphasis on the selection of the best-suited candidates for a given vacancy.

4. Regardless of their particular emphasis, contemporary administrative systems must develop staffing procedures which guarantee transparency, equity, fairness and justice carried out through open competition and qualified as merit-based recruitment. Candidates must meet requirements such as citizenship, legal adulthood, a clean criminal record, academic credentials, and, when necessary for the kind of tasks to be performed, physical fitness. In special cases applicants may be obliged to meet additional requirements of knowledge, skills and professional experience demanded by the content of the job in terms. To make certain this, some kind of tests, interviews and c.v. assessment could be needed.

5. As an exception to the open competition rule, mostly in employment systems or for temporary jobs in career systems, vacancies can be filled by free selection of the head or the board of directors of the related department or agency, decision that can be subjective but not arbitrary, as

⁸ These two distinctive administrative traditions can be respectively qualified as “normative” and “operational”. Tsekos Th., (2006), «Modeling Public Administration: Normative versus Operational administrative tradition in EU member states», Proceedings, International Conference, Institute of History, State and Law Academy of Sciences of Moldova, Kisinau, Moldova, pp102-106.
there always must exist a legal obligation to select the most qualified and experienced applicant according to pre-defined and made known criteria. Highly structured mechanisms of appeal against decisions on recruitment must complement selection procedures in order to implement the principles of meritocracy and equal access to public jobs.

6. Remuneration alone, though an important incentive, doesn’t suffice to improve public sector performance. Organizational and, wider, social recognition play an important role in enhancing devotion to the public service. Especially in developing countries, the image of a public servant enjoying a level of living that is far higher than the standard of living of the population is unacceptable. Ways other than increasing salaries trying to outbid the private sector in terms of remuneration should be used to attract and retain qualified staff.

7. The necessary professional knowledge, skills and positive attitudes for the public sector are constantly and speedily evolving. Therefore recruitment must be combined with a number of actions for continuously updating knowledge, skills and attitudes according to changes in needs. These actions include a philosophy and practice of promoting continuous learning in the public service, high-quality training institutions, as well as coaching, teamwork and rotations, among other learning techniques for improving capacity not of individuals but of institutions.
8. Common social practices such as discrimination against women, minority groups and people with disabilities augment the probabilities of leaving some of the countries capacity talent unutilized. In order to fully utilize available social capacities, the public administration should adopt appropriate equal opportunity policies and practices.

9. A sound recruitment process must, finally, observe the following prerequisites. The vacancy and details of the relevant recruitment process must be publicized as widely as possible through the national or local press, radio and TV, the internet etc. In some cases concerning chiefly permanent positions a publication of a formal decision in the official gazette could be required. A sufficient period of time should be offered to candidates in order to prepare the required documents and/or the examination. An evaluation body composed by people having adequate experience in the matter, must evaluate the candidates on a comparative basis. Relatives or friends of candidates cannot be members of such a body.
CHAPTER 2:
E.U. MEMBER STATES RECRUITMENT SYSTEMS

The public service recruitment systems in the EU member states are the following⁹

2.1. AUSTRIA

Public Administration is the responsibility of the Federal Chancellery that also co-ordinates the matters of the federal staff (general administrative service, law enforcement, military officers, judges and public prosecutors, university professors, teachers and health service staff). The number of employees is approx. 133,000 at the federal level, 180,000 at the länder level and 70,000 at the municipality level).

A distinction between civil servants and contract staff is made:

Civil servants are employed by appointment, a public law contract for life. Contract staff is salaried employees comparable to the wage-earners in the private sector. Their service contracts are based on federal or province laws. Employment under contract is the normal form of employment in the Federal Administration.

Aptitude tests for hiring at "standard posts" are required. In cases of special jobs requiring a special degree of expert know-how and skills (computer experts, engineers, etc), there are interviews instead of aptitude tests.

There is no legal entitlement to promotion for civil servants. Only those assigned to higher-level tasks will attain the highest service grade in their respective category, depending on the rating of the post and on assessed performance. Newly recruited staff is employed under an advancement-based system. Civil servants move on to the next higher salary scale at biannual intervals.

2.2. BELGIUM
The federal ministries employ about 60,500 staff and the Ministry of Finance more than half of that. During the 1980s and 1990s, the federal civil service has been reduced in terms of function and number. The federal level now employs two-thirds of public employees. There is a long-standing tradition of autonomous nongovernmental executive agencies.
Parliamentary acts on civil service matters are limited while relevant regulations take mostly the form of royal decrees. No Civil Service Act exists but a 1937 royal decree contains detailed provisions about recruitment, selection, staff evaluation and promotion built on the principles of neutral administration, equal opportunity between French and Flemish employees and competition-based selection. While statutory employment is formally the standard, agencies call increasingly upon contract employees.

Access to the civil service is only possible through competitive examination organised by the Federal Selection and Recruitment Office (SELOR).

Promotion, almost always internal, is formally based on objective factors such as length of service, and performance appraisal. In practice however, political criteria have played a major role mostly in the promotion of graduated civil servants. Performance reviews have been usually mere formalities. The advice of the Departmental Board of Directors has been ignored by ministers. A new system of promotion was recently introduced.

There are five grades, from the highest to the lowest: 1, 2, 2+, 3 and 4. Grade 1 is restricted to university graduates, but promotion from grade 2 is possible. Level 2+ was added to cover specialized functions requiring higher education. Within grade 1, there are a number of sub-grades, distinguishing between secretary-general, director-general, counsellor general, etc.
Remuneration is based on seniority. Social security is distinct from the private sector and civil servants enjoy a stand alone special pension scheme although salaries are in general lower than the private sector.

2.3. CYPRUS

The Public Service Act 1990/ No. 1. concerns the public sector as a whole and provides for:

- the creation of a "Public Service Commission";
- the structure of the public sector;
- recruitment, promotion, transfer, resignation, duties, obligations and rights of Public Servants;
- fundamental rights of public officers, freedom of expression and freedom of association
- conditions of work, working hours and the Code of Discipline

The public service, counts approximately 14,000 posts under three categories according to the criterion of potential appointments:

- First Entry posts for the appointment of both newcomers or public employees
- First Entry and Promotion posts for the appointment of newcomers or the promotion of public servants;
- Promotion posts exclusively for the promotion of public servants already in the lower grade of the particular agency.
Expert posts are referred under a specific Department while administrative posts are interchangeable and referred under the Ministry of Finance.

The Public Service Commission is the main organ for public personnel management. Its five members including the president are nominated by the President of the Republic for a six-year term. They have the duty to:

- appoint,
- confirm tenure,
- promote,
- transfer,
- second,
- exercise disciplinary control
- dismiss and
- retire civil servants.

The Public Service Law in effect, as well as other pertinent laws and regulations, are meticulous in describing the procedure which has to be followed for filling vacancies in the offices of each category.

All vacancies in First Entry or First Entry and Promotion post are publicised in the Official Gazette. The first appointment selection is made according to the following criteria:

- Written tests performance
• Formal qualifications
• Previous experience
• Interviews

While promotion selection takes into consideration
• Seniority
• Appraisal reports
• Recommendations of the superior officers

The salary of a post is referred to a scale ranging from step A1 (e.g. the post of a secretary) to A16 (e.g. the post of a Director).

2.4. CZECH REPUBLIC
The Civil Service Act adopted in June 2002 is fully implemented since 2007. The Act regulates the status, conditions of service, educational requirements, obligations, rights and remuneration of civil servants and other state employees. The Civil Service Act provides that:
• Vacancies at all levels are advertised and filled by open competition
• Open competition is also required for promotion,
• A salary system for civil servants based on 12 salary grades and 12 salary classes (seniority steps) in line with the assessment and the designation of positions. Advances within the pay classes are conditional on a satisfactory appraisal of performance.
2.5. DENMARK

The Danish state comprises approximately 160,000 employees, while the broader public sector comprises approximately 750,000 employees, corresponding to a third of the Danish labour market.

Only senior managers, judges, law enforcement, penitentiary and military staff are civil servants. All other public staff categories are employed on a collective contract basis. Individual contracts are used for the appointment of high ranking officials in order to ensure more flexible terms of employment (special remuneration and dismissal conditions, special retirement schemes etc.).

Ministries, and other government agencies institutions can freely recruit according to their specific needs, under total payroll (for ministries and agencies) and total budget (for framework-financed institutions i.e. universities and vocational schools), limitations.

Remuneration and employment terms are subject to collective bargaining between the Ministry of Finance (State Employer’s Authority) and the individual employee organizations. In case of salary grades, seniority advancement to the next salary grade takes normally place after two years.

The State Employer’s Authority develops and implements a series of two-year career -development programmes targeting human resources experts, project staff, financial management controllers etc..
2.6. ESTONIA

Estonian civil service system includes career staffs exercising public authority, while other types of position-based public employment, regulated by the ordinary labour law, cover auxiliary jobs.

Local government personnel are covered by the same regulations whereas special statutes exist for the diplomatic corps, the military, the judiciary and the law enforcement staff.

Open competition is in principle the recruitment and promotion method for civil servants. However, some important institutions (i.e. the Presidency, the Supreme Court, the State Audit Office etc.) fill vacancies through discretion selection, while advancement within categories is also generally effected on a discretion selection basis. Training is not mandatory for career advancement and training needs analysis is rare.

Salary scales are defined within a unified scheme for public administration employees. But as budgetary surpluses caused by vacancies, are used for bonuses and allowances, variations in payment among agencies are sometimes considerable.

A public employee’s appraisal system is introduced composed by an annual performance review by immediate superiors and a three years evaluation
process by a central evaluation committee, but it is considered as rather formalistic and is loosely related to bonuses and promotion.

2.7. **FINLAND**

The state employees are approximately 125,000 persons divided in two categories:

- civil servants (approx 97,000)
- employees on contract under labour law.

Municipal staff is also composed by civil servants and contract employees on equal proportion.

The Ministry of Finance issues general policy guidelines concerning the employees of the state administration. The state agencies implement independently their own personnel policies concerning:

- vacancies,
- recruitment,
- HR development,
- salaries, etc.

Central administration supervises and directs the implementing agencies through a management-by results approach in their respective policy fields.
The Finnish civil service has open recruiting, clear legal but open qualifications for entry to the civil service and a promotion system which is also open.

The examinations which are claimed are the normal university examinations. The rights and duties of state civil servants are stipulated in the State Civil Servants Act. The legal status and general terms of civil servants to be more equal to those of other employees.

Finland follows the position rather than the career system. No elite educational institution (i.e. School of P.A.) has been established for the preparation of high-flyers in the civil service. At the highest level of the state and the local administration some “hidden political appointments” take place.

Salaries and other terms of employment of the state personnel are defined through collective agreements similar to those effected in the private sector. New pay systems in the public sector are based on individual performance evaluation linked to a programme for productivity improvement through public management development strategy and supported by human resources IT systems.

2.8. FRANCE

Public employees in France are civil servants, contractual employees, magistrates and military staff.
The total number of civil servants is approximately 4.8 millions divided in:

- 2.3 million State employees (fonction publique d’Etat),
- 1.1 million local administration employees (fonction publique territoriale)
- 800,000 public hospital administrative employees (fonction publique hospitalière)
- 600,000 employees of public institutions (établissements publics).

There are three educational categories defining hierarchical level, employment conditions and salary level. Category A includes degree holders, category B comprises secondary school graduates and category C includes secretarial and auxiliary staff. Each category is sub-divided into professional bodies (corps).

The Civil Service General Statute is the main legal framework regulating all career civil servants while specific statutes have also been developed for each corps.

Two types of highly competitive exams are organised:

- External exams for recruitment, open to everybody, under given conditions
- Internal exams for promotion, open to civil servants that meet specific criteria (seniority etc.)

The majority of public employees follow a career-system climbing steps within a grade, on an automatic seniority basis. In order to have access to superior grades, positive evaluation and/or success to appropriate exams is required.
Mobility procedures such as secondment (détachement) or job reassignment are available for higher category staff.

Civil servants belonging to some prestigious professional bodies (grands corps) and/or occupying top management positions are considered to form the French Higher Civil Service, including all staffs involved in policy design (haute fonction publique). Informal membership of such an influential group doesn’t depend on seniority. Top public managers rotate every three to six years and can get a special leave to work for some time in semi-public or even private corporations.

Access to top management jobs usually requires graduation from the National School of Public Administration (ENA) or other similar public training institutions (i.e. Polytechnic School for engineers etc.). ENA holds annually three different types of entry exams every year:

- external, for university graduates
- internal, for civil servants aiming to get promoted;
- external, for people from the private and non governmental sector as well for former elected officials.

The French public service is highly fragmented, due to:

- the parallel existence of five different sub-categories of civil service (State employees, local staff, health staff, public institutions staff and contractual staff).
the diversity of public employers (ministries, local governments, health services)
the existence, within the permanent civil service of a great number of different professional bodies (corps), with distinct hierarchy and career paths.

The government and civil service unions negotiate salaries annually. Civil servants at the same hierarchical level in each professional body (corps) and ministry get the same basic salary, while bonuses and other benefits vary by corps.

2.9. GERMANY

The federal administrative framework generates differentiated statuses and cultures that make German civil service to a large extent multifaceted, yet, common basic features exist at all levels.

There are three statuses of employment

- civil servants (Beamte), including judges and military staff
- contract staff employed under private law (Angestellte)
- wage-earners (Arbeiter).

The civil servants follow a career system under four categories:

- administrative (höherer dienst),
- executive (gehobener dienst)
Each category is composed of five grades. Civil servants have in principle a lifetime tenure, whereas other public employment is based on unlimited or time limited private law contracts, under conditions that are defined through collective negotiations between the public employer at the federal, state and municipality level and the respective syndicates. Formal qualifications are required for the entrance to the civil service. There is no central recruitment process and each ministry or local authority has the right to recruit. Recruitment is effected through open competition. Candidates are selected for a specific job and not for a career.

A small part of the public service (413 of the 130,000 federal staffs) are considered as “politicized” civil servants that have to support the essential political values and goals of the government. For that reason, holders of jobs like permanent state secretaries and under-secretaries, senior civil servants in the Foreign Office and in the security services can be placed in temporary retirement.

Each career path is linked to a seniority based salary scale while top positions are remunerated according to a special scale without seniority increments.
2.10. GREECE
The total number of public employees is approximately 700,000 including state and municipal staff, personnel of education, health and social security services, the judiciary, the military and law enforcement mechanisms.

Civil servants enjoy tenure under the public law, while only scientific and temporary staff is recruited on private contract under the labour law for respectively unlimited and/ or limited time.

Recruitment is carried out by the Higher Council for Staff Selection (ASEP) an independent administrative authority. The Ministry of the Interior, Public Administration and Decentralization coordinates formally the human resources planning, but still ministries and other public agencies decide independently on their proper personnel needs upon governmental authorization.

Vacancies are filled through competitive exams (for administrative staff) or selection based on measurable criteria (for technical and temporary staff). Selected persons are nominated by decision of the competent minister or the head of independent authority. Nominated civil servants enter a career system. Promotion is effected on a seniority basis combined with performance appraisal and competitive selection for top management posts. Job reassignments and secondments can be made upon request of the employee and can become compulsory in special cases.
Remuneration follows a salary scale common for all civil servants, while some additional emoluments are specific for each ministry. Salary is automatically augmented upon seniority and additional payment is linked to jobs with increased responsibilities (top and middle managers).

2.11. HUNGARY
Civil servants are only those public employees that by the nature of their functions exert administrative authority, providing expertise or participating in decision making procedures. While appointed they enter a career path.

Recruitment procedures depend on the post to be filled. Executive jobs are publicized and filled through open competition, while for lower level posts open announcement and competition are not compulsory for the recruiting agency. In these cases candidates are invited to apply and those nominated follow a 12 months training program and must succeed a final examination. If not the service relationship is terminated.

Promotion to top management positions for civil servants holding a university degree goes through a compulsory examination. Otherwise seniority and performance appraisal are taking into account. Seniority is most important at the introductory and the final career grades.

Remuneration follows a unified salary scheme common for all civil servants, still completed with additional discretionary emoluments and bonuses that
differentiate extensively final payments among agencies. Salary scale has 17 grades for university graduates and 15 grades for secondary education graduates. Civil servants get better salaries comparing to other public employees.

2.12. IRELAND

The Irish public service counts about 235,000 employees divided into seven categories:

- Civil Service
- Local Authorities
- Health Service
- Education
- Defence Forces
- Security (An Garda Síochána)
- Semi-state sector.

208,000 employees are covered by the state budget while 27,000 people are included in local authorities budgets.

The three largest sectors are health staff (32%), education staff (28%) and the civil service (14%).

The Commission for Public Service is the regulatory body and the Public Appointments Service the central recruitment agency for public recruitment,
while in special cases, recruitment with the assistance of private sector recruitment agencies specifically approved by the Commission is possible.

Recruitment to all positions is subject to quality standards published by the Commission but still no compulsory centralized process is imposed. The exams are organized separately by local authorities such as the Urban District Councils, the Town Corporations and the County Councils.

Most public servants are promoted by a combination of incremental seniority progression, performance and suitability assessment and a competitive process of selection.

Public servants are paid through incremental salary scales determined by collective bargaining. All employees progress along the scale by annual increments within salary levels and salary promotions among salary levels. In addition, there are a wide range of additional sectoral allowances.

2.13. ITALY
The Italian state has a multi-facet structure shaped on a multiplicity of structural forms. The central government comprises twelve ministries, eighteen state agencies and a number of independent authorities plus diverse national and local public bodies, from the Central Institute for Statistics to the National Agency for Environmental Protection.
The total number of civil service at the central level (ministries, aziende autonome, independent authorities) is about 343,000 while the total public employment at all levels (central, regional and local) goes up to 3,500,000.

The civil law applies to civil servants with some exceptions, although an increased tendency towards deregulation facilitates collective bargaining and contractual work relations.

Recruitment is subject to open competition. The terms of employment of civil servants vary according to the specific post. A postgraduate degree is compulsory for senior civil servants that are recruited through competitive examination common for all central state agencies. Top management assignments have a fixed term of 2 to 7 years. Directors-general can be outsiders, in principle on a two year temporary individual contract.

A geographical bias makes 73% of state civil servants and 93% of directors-general coming from the Center and South regions with population around 45%.

Italian civil service has a career system. The state civil service is classified into nine categories, each related to a specific salary. The promotion system is based on a combination of seniority and evaluation. A Government agency (ARAN) represents the State in labour negotiations at the national level. ARAN uses contract details input from all kind of public agencies such as ministries, independent agencies, local authorities, health care agencies, universities,
research institutes, schools etc. Terms of early retirement are currently under discussion.

2.14. LATVIA

The State Chancellery plays a leading role in personnel policy development, and in implementation of the Civil Service Law. The tasks of the Civil Service Administration, under the supervision of the Prime Minister, focus on personnel policy co-ordination and control of the civil service.

Civil servants are persons whose tasks are closely linked to policy making including general and specialized administration, the diplomatic services, the state revenue service, the police, the border guards, prison guards etc. Supplementary specific statutes exist for those groups. Other pieces of legislation affecting the civil service are the Law on Preventing Corruption and the Law on Disciplinary Violations.

The Act does not cover politicians, namely, all of which come under a special law. Advisors and assistants to the Prime Minister, Ministers, Deputy Ministers, Ministers of State, and Parliamentary Secretaries are political appointees and recruited on limited labour contracts. Support staff in state administration is not considered as civil servants.

All civil service vacancies are publicly announced and filled through open competition. The Civil Service Administration provides the rules while individual
agencies control their own recruitment processes. The top management posts are selected through a centralized procedure. Upon proposal of a selection commission, the appointment is made by the Prime Minister, the Minister or the Head of the recruiting agency, depending on the position. Appointments to top management positions have to be approved by the Council of Ministers. Appointment is made for unlimited period, after a successful probation period. Transfers between ministries are possible, and in specific cases compulsory. Rotation among top management posts is established.

Promotion is generally made through open competition while performance appraisal as an additional promotion and bonuses criterion is implemented.

Many different pay scales in place regulate salaries for different categories of civil servants and public employees. An interim unified salary scheme applies only to a small number of state civil servants.

For highly qualified civil staff “management contracts” and for top positions a contractual system with flexible salary determination based on performance evaluation, was introduced. Nevertheless, as the decision for such contracts is made by the head of the institution, their linkage to performance was limited.

The implementation of the unified salary scheme, met with serious obstacles related to the professional qualification groupings.
2.15. LITHUANIA

The Department of Public Administration under the Ministry of the Interior is responsible for service policy including drafting implementing relevant legislation and managing the register of civil servants.

The Public service Law defines the general regulations for all public servants, while specific statutes regulate different public service corps. The Law combines elements of the career systems, with elements of position-based civil service system. Public employees are divided into career civil servants and non-civil servants. Labour Code partially applies to public employees in health and education services while auxiliary posts in ministries are no civil service positions.

Recruitment is based on merit and open competition. Each institution is in control of its recruitment and appointment processes. Recruitment Commissions exist, within each institution are composed of career civil servants, experts and, eventually, political appointees. Candidates are selected through a written examination, and successful nominees have to undergo a two years probation period leading to a performance assessment for final appointment or dismissal.

Some high ranking vacancies termed ‘civil servants of political confidence’ are recruited through selection on the basis of political or personal confidence for a period not exceeding the term of office of the recruiting elected or political appointee or collegial body.
Promotion is effected upon performance evaluation made by the immediate superior and a Certification Commission specific to each institution. The results of the appraisal may lead to promotion, the award of a bonus, or to being demoted, or even dismissed from the civil service, under certain circumstances defined in law.

A unified salary scheme for the whole civil service administration is based on the category of the post and the grade. Grades are based on job. Remuneration is composed of a basic salary and a seniority rating (up to 30 percent of the basic salary), allowances for overtime and performance bonuses. Funds from unfilled vacancies must not be used for bonuses but in practice this happens, while there is managerial discretion for bonus allocation.

2.16. LUXEMBOURG
The Ministry for Public Service and Administrative Reform is responsible for the personnel policy. The total number of civil service staff is 14,212 divided into 5 categories:

- General administration (5,018)
- Judiciary (444)
- Police Force (1,807)
- Education (6,667)
- Religion (276).
Vacancies are assessed by the Council of Government, upon the opinion of the Savings and Rationalisation Commission (SRC). The recruitment is made by competitive examination organised by the Ministry for Public Service and Administrative Reform. The final selection is made by the concerned departments.

Civil servants follow a career system linked to their educational profile at three levels: basic level, medium level, and higher-level education. They can change career paths. There are about fifty different grades which are grouped into seven categories, which offer different career and remuneration conditions: general administration, human resources, paramedics, education, social services, and religion.

Remuneration and benefits are linked to grade, performance, and family situation.

2.17. MALTA
An independent Public Service Commission (PSC) to supervise the public service was established in 1964 composed of seven members appointed by the President, upon advice of the Prime Minister and consultation with the Leader of the Opposition. The PSC makes recommendations to the Prime Minister on personnel management issues. Recruitment and promotion procedures are regulated by law. The law provides for open and competitive selection of public servants. There are clear recruitment, career, and salary structures in the public
service. However there are autonomous agencies or authorities, some of which have been set up in relation with the enforcement of the acquis, which have different salary structures.

The Public Service is part of the wider public sector and consists of staff recruited under the authority of the Public Service Commission and serving in Ministries.

Calls for the filling of vacancies are approved by the Commission and published in the Government Gazette and the local press. Internal calls for applications, open to serving public officers, are publicized by internal circulars issued by the Office of the Prime Minister (Management and Personnel Office) or by the department concerned.

The selection process, as a rule, consists of a combination of a written examination or test and an interview. However, the Commission may authorize other selection methods which it considers appropriate.

Successful candidates are appointed to a grade (e.g. Principal, Technical Officer, Economic Officer) within one of the 60 different career streams with promotion routes from one grade to the next within each stream. Appointments to positions are the rule for senior managers. For specific lower level positions, staff is appointed for definite periods with the possibility of renewal. Remuneration is made on the basis of a 20-scale salary scheme.
2.18. THE NETHERLANDS

Public employment is based on appointments to a specific post and is not career oriented.

The civil service system is based on public law distinct from general labour law because civil servants.

- have a public appointment by the Government
- are subject to specific disciplinary legislation
- can only be dismissed for reasons specified in the General Civil Service Act

Otherwise job conditions of civil servants are to a large extent similar to those of the private sector.

The public service is organised in twelve sectors of which the central Government staff is one.

The Senior Public Service is a distinct group comprising about eight hundred members including:
- secretaries-general,
- directors-general,
- inspectors-general
- directors
Educational background, work experience and motivation are the recruitment criteria. Each department follows its own recruitment policy. There are no general competitive entry exams. With the exception of some specialized services like the fiscal authorities all kind of vacancies are open to anyone who meets the job qualifications. There are no seniority requirements for promotion and high achievers can have a fast career. In practice most civil servants make a career by hopping from one position to another.

The Senior Public Service members are responsible for their own career planning, nevertheless, the SPS Office offers coaching and leadership development programmes.

The salary scales for each job level are specified by decree, while some additional emoluments such as sickness benefits are subject to collective bargaining on a central or sectoral basis.

2.19. POLAND

The Civil Service corps does not include employees of local self-government and public agencies such as the Chancellery of the Parliament, the President’s Chancellery, the Ombudsman’s Office, etc which do not report to the Prime Minister.

Recruitment is decentralized to the different Ministries and regional agencies through an open and competitive process. Announcements on vacancies should
be placed in the Civil service Bulletin including duties and requirements. New employees get a preparatory service fixed term contract for a maximum of 3 years ending with an assessment by an examining committee. Then the candidate either gets a permanent contract, or the one he/she had is terminated. Competitive recruitment procedures are mandatory only for a limited number of positions at the higher category of civil servants.

Promotion is supposed to be based on periodical assessments by in-line managers every two years. Objective job evaluations have not been established.

Remuneration comprises the basic salary, a premium based on the grade held and a reward for special performance discretionary allocated by the Directors-General.

2.20. PORTUGAL
Public employment is subdivided to the following categories:

- State employees
- Autonomus Regional employees (Autonomous Regions of Azores and Madeira, approx. 34,000)
- Local Government employees (approx. 116,000).

State employees are differentiated into:

- Direct Administration employees (ministries approx. 360,000).
• Indirect Administration employees, (organizations with own legal personality supervised by the Government, approx. 200,000)

Career system is prevailing in the Portuguese public service. The Directorate General for Public Administration, a cross sectional service, is responsible for the management of human resources. DGAP, develops central policy directions, even though implementation is decentralized and each ministry or other autonomous administrative entity is responsible for the recruitment, training, promotion and mobility of its personnel.

2.21. SLOVAK REPUBLIC

The civil service includes positions with responsibility for the execution of state authority. In parallel with the Civil Service a Public Service exists, mainly based on Labour Law (municipalities, health services, schools, etc.).

The key institution for recruitment, training and law drafting on Civil Service issues is the Civil Service Office.

Civil Service recruitment and promotion must be based on open competition and selection procedure. Vacancies must be announced in the Civil Service Gazette and in commercial newspapers. All positions in the civil service are open to outside applicants. A Selection Commission assesses candidates on the basis of skills, professional knowledge, and, in specific cases, psychological profile. The recruiting ministry makes the appointment according to the opinion of the
Commission. Direct appointment is possible only for superior officers in a political position.

The salary scheme for civil servants comprises 9 salary classes, 12 salary categories, and performance bonuses. Basic salaries in the civil service are low.

2.22. SLOVENIA
The public service encompasses employees in State and self-government administrations. There is a clear distinction between ordinary civil servants (called “workers in state organs”) and political appointees (called “functionaries”). Functionaries such as ministers, state secretaries, and heads of government agencies take administrative decisions. Policy advisers named “contractual public servants” who are hired without public competition and their tenure is attached to that of the minister.

The Law requires the public announcement of vacancies and regulated the entrance procedures to the civil service by open competition through interview by a commission and examinations. The Government appoints senior officials, while ministers have this authority for lower grades. A successful probationary period of six months is a condition for permanent tenure. Direct appointment to higher positions is possible, but internal promotions or transfers are the rule. Performance appraisal is used only for salary scale promotion. The pay scheme comprises 65 classes of basic salary plus performance bonuses and additional benefits.
2.23. SPAIN

The Regions have increased freedom to regulate their civil service.

Entry to public administration is achieved through a public competition exam.

Regarding the central state access to the civil service is annually planned through the Public Employment Offer, which reflects ministerial vacancies. Only understaffed agencies are allowed to recruit. Agencies have reacted using intensively temporary contracts for permanent jobs. As a consequence of this policy the capacity to recruit staff both for corps and agencies has been highly restricted.

A career system within corps applies with 30 grades. Recruitment or promotion to grades 1-29 are made on a merit basis while grade 30 vacancies are filled by political appointees. Promotion to the next grade can is made after two years in the post. The civil servant that holds a grade 30 (deputy general director) post may be downgraded to an inferior post but still retains the status of grade 30.

Political appointees include:

- appointments in the top ministerial level, made by the prime minister through a decree endorsed by the king;
- appointments to the second (junior ministers, under-secretary and general secretary) and
• appointment to the general director rank are made by decree of the government, on the recommendation of the competent minister or junior minister.

The payment scheme is common to all civil servants while ministries determine pay scales for contractual staff.

There are the following main remuneration components:

• Basic salary and seniority increase (trienios) represent from 30 to 50 per cent of total remuneration depending

• guaranteed allowances make the second major bulk of the whole salary. There are three main allowances: rank allowance (depending on the grade), post allowance (depending on the job) and individual allowance (performance-related payment). The individual allowance is normally agreed upon with the relevant trade union for each administrative.

2.24. SWEDEN

About 250,000 of a 1.3 million total public sector employees are employed by the central government administration. The Government and the Parliament do not influence the collective agreements on salaries and employment conditions for government staff. Public employment policy is delegated to the Swedish Agency for Government Employers (SAGE).
The Labour law regulates the public sector employment while some specific rules also apply. The position-based system is followed and (with the exception of the judiciary, police and foreign affairs) there are no life-long tenure or civil service career paths in central government. “Promotions” and “careers” in the public sector are made through applications to superior level vacancies. Even then government employees have no priority against outsiders.

There are minimum educational requirements for certain posts (i.e judges, foreign affairs staff, law enforcement staff etc.), but skills and competence criteria are dominant.

No centralized recruitment procedure exists. The government appoints the directors-general and other senior officials heading the public agencies while all other vacancies are filled by each individual agency. Employment conditions are comparable to those of the private sector labour market.

Salary schemes for central government are agreed through collective bargaining.

Individual agencies are responsibility to negotiate employment conditions. Individual salaries are defined on the basis of the job responsibilities, the employees’ performance and the relevant labour market payment conditions.
2.25. UNITED KINGDOM

The UK Civil Service Commission:

- guarantees recruitment to the Civil Service on a merit basis through open competition,
- approves appointments by recruitment to the most senior levels
- hears appeals under the Civil Service Code

Recruitment, with the exception of senior civil servants, is made by the departments and agencies, through examinations and interviews. The Civil Service Commission provides a recruitment framework and audits the individual recruitment systems for compliance with the code. Departments and agencies are obliged to publish information about their recruitment.

Promotion is under the responsibility of departments and agencies. Fast career tracks permit civil servants with high capacities specially selected and trained, to ascend speedily to the top management positions. To reach the top levels usually requires a university degree.

There is no corps system, but a series of grades varying between departments from Administrative Assistant to Permanent Secretary. In principle any official may ascent to the distinct Senior Civil Service category.

All Government departments and executive agencies have responsibility for their own salary and payment schemes with the exception of the Senior Civil Service.
Starting salaries depend on the location of work and the overall package can vary from department to department.

The Performance and Reward Division within the Cabinet Office supports best practice personnel management policies within the Civil Service.
CHAPTER 3:
THE SITUATION IN SUDAN

The situation in Sudan will be discussed with reference to the Constitutional provisions and other relevant laws in order to have an overview of the rules as stated and the actual implementation on the ground.

3.1. The Interim National Constitution of the Republic of the Sudan

Under part 7 of the Interim National Constitution titled “The National Civil Service, 5 articles are related to the national civil service as follows:

The National Civil Service

---

10 Comprehensive Peace Agreement. In an event that marked a turning point in the history of the Sudan, on 9 January 2005, the Government of the Sudan, represented by Vice-President Ali Osman Taha, and the Sudan People’s Liberation Movement/Army (SPLM/A), represented by Chairman John Garang, signed in Nairobi, Kenya, the Comprehensive Peace Agreement. It includes agreements on outstanding issues remained after the Machakos Protocol and has provisions on security arrangements, power-sharing in the capital of Khartoum, some autonomy for the south, and more equitable distribution of economic resources, including oil. The Agreement consists of four protocols, two framework agreements and two annexes regarding the implementation modalities of the aforementioned protocols and framework agreements. The parties acknowledge in the chapeau of the agreement that, taken together, the documents represent a concrete model for solving the wider problem of conflict within the country and that, should it be successfully implemented, the Comprehensive Peace Agreement will provide a model of good governance in the Sudan that will help to create a solid basis for the preservation of peace and will make unity appear attractive. As a result of the Comprehensive Peace Agreement, the Interim National Constitution was passed.
135 (1) The National Service shall consist of all employees at the national level of the government who will impartially carry out the functions assigned to them according to law.

(2) The law shall determine terms and conditions of service, duties and rights of employees of the National Civil Service.

Guidelines for Inclusiveness in the National Civil Service

136. The national Civil Service, notably at the senior and middle levels, must be representative of the people of the Sudan; to ensure this the following principles and guidelines must be recognized and observed:

a) Imbalances and disadvantages in recruitment must be redressed.

b) Merit is important and training is necessary.

c) No level of government shall discriminate against any qualified Sudanese citizen on the basis of religion, ethnicity, region or gender.

d) Fair competition for jobs.

e) Application of affirmative action and job training to achieve targets for equitable representation within a specified time frame.

f) Creation of additional training opportunities for conflict affected people.
3.2. Other National Laws

a) Labour Act of 1997\(^\text{11}\)

The abovementioned Act applied to all employees in Sudan with the following exemptions:

a. The Members of the Judiciary;
b. The Counsels of the Ministry of Justice;
c. The personnel of the Disciplinary Forces;
d. The personnel of the National Security Organization;
e. The personnel employed in the federal and states governments and the public corporations whose conditions of employment are governed by special laws and the regulations concerning the industrial relation and industrial safety;
f. The domestic servants according to the definition specified in the Domestic Servants Act 1955;
g. The agricultural workers, other than persons employed in the operations, repair or maintenance of mechanical appliances and devices, and other than persons employed in factories, ginneries, diaries and similar establishments in which agricultural products are processed or adopted for marketing and other than persons employed in the administration of agricultural undertakings or doing clerical accounts work, stores, gardens, and poultry;

\(^{11}\) This law was passed according to the Constitutional Decree No. 3 of 1995 the National Assembly has passed and the President of the Republic has ratified the Act.
h. The members of the employer’s family residing with him and wholly dependent upon him;
i. The casual workers;
j. Any category the Ministry Council may declare by an order that they are exempted totally or partially from the provisions of this Act.

It is important to study the definition of relevant terminologies in the national law;

- "Worker" is any person male or female not less than 16 years old who performs work in return for wages of whatever type in service and subject to the management or supervision of the employer, whether his contract of service is written or oral, expressed or implied or for the purpose of training or probation, or who performs manual or semi manual work whether skilled or unskilled in consideration of wage of whatever kind.
- "Production Worker" is the worker whose wage is based on the amount of daily work or piecework.
- "Casual Worker" is any person who performs temporary work in a factory for a period not exceeding fifteen days and of a nature, which is not included within the activity performed in the factory.

One of the controversial areas in this law regards the employment of women, which are regulated in section 19 and 20 of the law. In specific,

“Part IV. Employment of Women and Juveniles

58
Requirements of employment of women
19. No women shall be employed in works which are dangerous, demanding great bodily effort or prejudicial to health such as carrying heavy weights and work done under the ground or under water and also work which would expose them to poisonous substances, cold, or heat exceeding the reasonable limits women can withstand.

Time of employment of women
20.1 No women shall be allowed to work between 10 p.m. and 6 a.m. with the exception of employment of women in administrative, professional, technical work or social or health services work.

20.2 Notwithstanding the provision of subsection (1) the competent authority in consultation with the Commission may allow under the conditions prescribed by it, any class of women to work at night in response to the requirements of public interest.

20.3 The daily total rest intervals for women shall not be less than one hour with pay and the intervals shall be regulated so that the interval of rest extends for half an hour or more; provided that the working period shall not extend for five consecutive hours without such interval."
If these articles are read critically, it is evident that although the purpose of the legislature seemed to be to protect the women but there are still several concerns which can be summarized as follows:

- It contradicts the international standard which guarantees equal rights to work
- It includes an element of discrimination since it forbids women from working during certain hours
- It presumes that women were very weak and cannot be trusted
- It discriminates against the same group (i.e., women themselves) that is between women with administrative professional, technical work, social or health services work
- It provides a wide discretionary power to the Commission to allow or disallow women to work at night.

In PART III which is titled the Organization of Employment the Act stated some important rules in relation to public service and these are:

Establishment of employment exchanges
8.1. The minister may establish employment exchange and determine the areas or groups for the service of which such exchanged are concerned

8.2. The employment exchange is subject to the supervision of the competent authority.
8.3. Every unemployed person willing and able to work or every workman desirous of changing his work, may apply for the registration of his name for such purpose at the employment exchange concerned, presenting all the necessary particulars and documents in proof thereof.

8.4. The employment exchange may require any person willing to work or change his work to pass a vocation test which it thinks appropriate for proving his skills or to produce any necessary documents including the personal identity card in the places in which The Identity Cards Act, 1981 applies.

8.5. The employment exchange shall register every application presented to it which satisfied the conditions and shall give the applicant a certificate free of charge within a maximum period of two days from the time of presenting the application; provided that the validity of such certificate shall not exceed one year.

8.6. No person shall register his name at one time in more than one employment exchange or provide false details at the time of registration.

Private employment agencies
9.1. The Minister may in the cases of extreme necessity which so require and in accordance to the rules and conditions determined by him permit any person to establish private employment or carry on employment business; provided that
the employment agencies shall not charge any commission or obtain any fees from the workman in consideration for getting him employed.

Prohibition of employing unregistered persons
10. Without prejudice to the provisions of this Act, no project shall employ any person falling within the jurisdiction of any of the employment exchanges unless he has obtained a certificate of registration in accordance with the provision of section 8(4).

Nomination of employment
12.1. Subject to the provisions of the Public Service Act 1994 and the regulations made there under:
No notice for any post for the purpose of employment shall be issued by any means of publication or publicity except after obtaining a written permission from the competent employment exchange; and there shall be mentioned in the notice the serial number of the permission issued by the employment exchange.

Every project which employs ten persons or more and desires to employ any of the persons to whom this Act applies and who falls within the jurisdiction of any employment exchange shall apply to the competent employment exchange for nominating a person or persons who possess the required qualifications for the post; and the appointment shall be made from those nominated by the employment exchange; provided that the provision of this sub-section shall not apply to the employment of the following categories:
(i) employment of persons for casual work the performance of which does not take more than three months or any period determine by the Minster;
(ii) employment by the employer of the members of his family or his dependants;
(iii) principal posts the holders of which are considered as authorized representatives of the employer and the determination thereof shall be made by a decision of the Minister;
(iv) employment by an administrative body concerned with the welfare of ex-convicts

12.2. The Minster may make a decision to increase or reduce the number referred to in sub-section (1) hereof or order the exemption of any categories of workman from the provision thereof

12.3. Any project may publish a notice for any post under sub-section (I) in accordance with the condition of the post submitted to the employment exchange; and if the employment exchange notifies the project, to which the provision of sub-section (2) of this section apply, that there is no person among those registered therein who possesses the required qualification or the employment exchange has failed to submit a suitable nominee within two weeks from the date of the receipt of the application, in such case the project shall notify the competent employment exchange with the name and the qualification of the person who has been chosen for the post within a week from the date of his employment
Notification of the employment exchange of appointment

13. Every project appointing a person registered at an employment exchange shall return the certificate of registration of such person to the exchange after recording the required particulars thereon within a period of two weeks from the date of appointment.

Another important feature of this law is that it gives priority to the entitlement of the workers over any other debts after the judicial fees.\(^\text{12}\) Also in all litigation, suits raised by the worker or members of his family, or the trade unions, in respect of disputes connected with the provisions of this Act are exempted from judicial fees. But if the judgment is not in favour of the worker the Court may order the worker to pay all or part of such fees.\(^\text{13}\)

There are several other laws that require the existence of the appropriate conditions of service to ensure a transparent process of employment.

b) Public Service Act 1994

This law applied to all public service units whether at the federal or state level. Under Chapter 3 of this law a committee was establi sher which is called ‘Public Service Selection Committee’\(^\text{14}\), this Committee was mandated with:

-Drafting the principles and the basics for selection to public service at the federal and state level;

\(^\text{12}\) Article 71 of the Labour Act 1997
\(^\text{13}\) Article 72 of the Labour Act 1997
\(^\text{14}\) Article 13 of the Public Service Act 1995.
➤ Carrying the selection for the vacancies for federal government, public institutions and others.
➤ Announcement of vacancies.
➤ Statement about the vacancies in any government units.
➤ Competition processes whether through interviews, tests or both.

Under Chapter six of the law, article 30 expressly states for the accountability of all workers under the Employers accountability Act 1976 to ensure efficient and professional implementation of the job and the duties thereto.

The Experience of the Civil Service Staffing Council (ASEP)\textsuperscript{15} of Greece is remarkable in this area\textsuperscript{16}. The Council has specific independence safeguards included in the founding law, the members of the Council\textsuperscript{17} are characterized as senior state functionaries who enjoy personal independence and they are not subject to supervision and control by government bodies or other administrative authorities, but to parliamentary control according to Parliament's Rules of Procedure; moreover its acts are not subject to hierarchical control in terms of lawfulness, but only to judicial review. It is economically independent, having its own budget, and has a peculiar limited legal personality.

\textsuperscript{15} Law 2190/1994, according to this establishing law an independent authority responsible for verifying the faithful implementation of the provisions on civil service staff hirings.
\textsuperscript{16} Information taken in an official meeting with ASEP in the workshop organized by the Center of European Constitutional Law in Athens 13-19 January 2008.
\textsuperscript{17} ASEP is composed of 24 councilors (a president, two vice-presidents and 21 members) who are elected by the conference of the speakers of parliament.
The main powers of ASEP are to choose the permanent staff of the wider public sector; to control the legality of staff hiring procedures followed by agencies of the wider public sector; and to identify cases of illegal hiring, through ASEP’s Councilors-Inspectors who act as investigation officers.

c) The Judiciary Act 1986:
The Judiciary Act is an example of a law which was specifically considered as an exception of application of the Labour law 1997.

According to this law the appointment of the Chief Justice, his deputy, the Supreme Court Judges, Courts of Appeal Judges, General Courts Judges and District Judges is the authority of the President of the Republic and he also has the right to relieve them of office according to Article 22 of the Act.

Although this is the right of the President of the Republic there are certain conditions that need to satisfy to qualify for the job. These are:

- A Sudanese of full capacity
- Shall be in possession of a degree in law, from a university recognized in the Sudan.
- Shall not suffer a judgment to be passed against him, by a competent court, or a board of discipline, on a matter inconsistent with honour, or honesty even though a decision pardoning him has been passed.
- Shall be of commendable conduct, and good reputation.
An issue which seems controversial is that the appointment of judges is not liable to consent.\textsuperscript{18}

In the Constitutional Court Act 2005, the conditions for appointing the justices of the Court are stipulated and they are to some extent similar to the conditions of appointment mentioned in the Judiciary Act 1986, namely:

\begin{itemize}
  \item A Sudanese of full capacity, whose age shall not be less than forty years, and attested to for competence, chastity, credibility and disinterest;
  \item Not have suffered a final judgment, to be passed against him, from a competent court, in a matter in contravention of honour, or trust, even though a decision of pardon has been passed in his favour;
  \item Be of commendable reputation, and good behaviour and conduct;
  \item Be in possession of a high degree in law, from a university, recognized in Sudan;
  \item Have previous work, in any of the legal professions, or practiced law, in any of the universities, recognized in the Sudan, for a period, not less than twenty years.
\end{itemize}

There are other relevant laws in this area like the Public Service Pension Act 1993, Social Insurance Act 1995, and Accountability of Public Service employees 1976.

\textsuperscript{18} Article 31 of the Judiciary Act 1986.
When talking about recruiting it is one of the most complicated, misunderstood and mismanaged of all organizational activities. In recruiting the following should be considered:\(^1\):

1. The ability to think, problem solve, learn, use technology
2. The ability to plan, organize and sequence
3. The ability to work as part of a team to get things done—interpersonal
4. Attitudes, interests and motivations.

Looking at these four areas we find that they are very crucial in ensuring that the recruit is effectively and efficiently for the positions that we need to fill. But unfortunately they are not part of the requirements or conditions for recruitment in any public sector service.

3.3. Monitoring and Protection Mechanisms for public service staffing

There are different mechanisms for monitoring and also protecting different issues in relation to public staffing, and in this study we are referring to the following:

a) The National Civil Service Commission
This mechanism was stated for in the Interim National Constitution 2005 and it reads:

137 (1) A National Civil Service Commission shall be established and shall be composed of persons of proven competence, experience, integrity and impartiality.

(2) The National Civil Service Commission shall advise the national government in the formulation and execution of policies related to public service employment and employees.

(3) The National Civil Service Commission shall address imbalances in the National Civil Service in order to create a sense of national belonging.

b) Interim Tasks of the National Civil Service Commission

It was stated in the Constitution.

138. The National Civil Service Commission shall have the following tasks:

a) Formulation of policies for training and recruitment into the national civil service, targeting between twenty to thirty percent of the positions to be confirmed upon the outcome of the census referred to herein for the people of Southern Sudan who qualify.

b) Ensuring that not less than twenty percent of the middle and upper level positions of undersecretaries, are filled with qualified persons from Southern Sudan within the first three years of the Interim Period and achieving twenty five percent in five years and the final target figure referred to in sub-Article (a) above, within six years.
c) Reviewing, after the first three years of the Interim Period, the progress made in implementing the formulated policies and setting new goals and targets as necessary, taking into account the census results.

c) National Employees Justice Chamber

139 (1) There shall be established by law a National Employees Justice Chamber and shall be composed of a chairperson and members of proven competencies, experience, integrity and impartiality.

(2) The National Employees Justice Chamber shall be competent to consider and determine grievances by national public service employees, without prejudice to the right of resorting to courts.

(3) The supervision over the Chamber and appointment of its chairperson shall be made by the President of the Republic.

As we noticed in the provisions sited above there are some legal guarantees in the provisions as well as the creation of the two mechanisms, the National Civil Service Commission and the National Employees Justice Chamber which are considered as the monitoring bodies that ensure the legal guarantees specified in the Constitution. In addition to those, the Constitution also requires the establishment of the independent national human rights commission which is considered by the international community as an important institution and specifically encouraged different countries to establish it as specified in Paris Principles 1993.
d) National Human Rights Commission

142 (1) The President of the Republic shall, after consultation within the Presidency, establish an independent Human Rights Commission consisting of fifteen independent, competent non-partisan and impartial members. Their appointment shall be representative. It shall be independent in decision making.

(2) Representative of relevant government organs shall take part in the deliberations of the Commission in advisory capacity.

(3) The Human Rights Commission shall monitor the application of the rights and freedoms provided for in the Bill of Rights and shall receive complaints on violations thereof.

(4) The Human Rights Commission may express opinion or present advice to State organs on any issue related to human rights.

(5) The law shall specify the functions, powers, procedures, terms and conditions of service of the Commission.

e) Public Grievances Chamber

143 (1) There shall be established an independent body, to be known as the Public Grievances Chamber. Its chairperson and members shall be nominated by the President of the Republic from among persons of competence and integrity and approved by the National Assembly. The Chamber shall be responsible to the President of the Republic and the National Assembly.
(2) Without prejudice to the finality of judgments, the Chamber shall consider complaints relating to grievances suffered by citizens in relation to State institutions. The Chamber shall consider grievances only after exhausting all means and stages of litigation by the complainant.

(3) The Chamber shall make recommendations or propose remedies to the Presidency. The Chamber may on its own motion recommend to the Presidency or the National Assembly any measures it deems fit to ensure efficiency, justice or probity in the performance of the national governmental institutions in coordination with the various State organs.

(4) The law shall regulate the functions, procedures, terms and conditions of service of the members and employees of the Chamber.

f) Inspection and investigation
According to the Labour Law Act 1997 there is an inspection and investigation procedure specified in that Act as follows:

15.1 For the implementation of the provisions of this Act, the officials authorized by the Commission who shall carry cards evidencing their authorization shall have power to visit projects at any time to carry out the functions of inspection or investigation or examining documents or cards relating to the workmen and to require the necessary particulars from the employers or persons acting on their
behalf or to summon them if they decide it is necessary, and the employers or their agents or person shall facilitate the work of such officials and shall furnish them with the honest and correct information in relation to their work. The competent authorities shall give effective assistance to such officials in carrying out their functions if the situation so requires.

The Minister shall issue the orders necessary for the regulation of methods and procedure of inspection and the cards of the officials carrying out inspection.

g) The National and Federal Labour Relation Council
Under the labour law Act it was stated that a Council shall be established to be called “the National Labour Relations Council” by an order made by the Minister. And also a Council shall be established to be called “the Federal Labour Relations Council“ by an order made by the competent authority. The two Councils shall be responsible for the following:

- To give advice and consultation in matters referred to it by the Minister or the Governor;
- To help the Minister or the Governor in the framing of the general policy for labour relations, and in the supervision of the implementation of such policy;
- To help the Minister in regulating, developing, consolidating labour relation and improving the relation between the employer and workers to create favourable conditions for work and production.
➢ To make studies and submit recommendations in the field of labour relations, to the Minister or the Governor for their decision.

3.4. Identified Problems:
Some of the identified problems in the public sector staffing in Sudan are the following:

1. Appointment processes are sometimes taking place without sufficient notification resulting in the absence of qualified candidates while it also affects the rights of Sudanese citizens in other states because Sudan is a very huge country

2. Appointments are sometimes politicized, in the sense that if one is affiliated to the governing system will have better chances despite the objective qualifications

3. Women are forbidden from competing in certain public service sector positions like the Judiciary. Although according to the law, nothing to that effect exists, but in practice since the early nineties no women have been selected as judges.

4. Lack of training opportunities, especially when it comes to training of women outside the country

5. Promotion of employees does not take place regularly.

6. Lack of measures for ensuring the transparent functioning of the public sector.
CHAPTER 4:
LESSONS LEARNED FROM THE INTERNATIONAL EXPERIENCE:
THREE CASE STUDIES

4.1. The American Experience
The International Public Management Association for Human Resources (IPMA-HR) a non-profit organization representing 7,500 HR managers working for the most part in the public sector, published a study of the recruiting and staffing processes in the US public sector. The study, conducted by EquaTerra consulting firm, was based on the survey of about 150 senior-level employees of all main public sector categories in the United States\(^\text{20}\).

4.1.1. HR management models
The majority of the assessed organizations (42%) apply a mixed career and employment system while 25% have a pure employment system and 21% a pure merit-based, career system. Shared services e.g. organizational units providing HR services to all or some divisions in the organization is clearly the most common operating environment for public sector HR organizations. 74%

of the assessed organizations utilize a fully shared services model for HR functions, while 4% utilize shared services for some divisions.

4.1.2. Strategic planning for HR
Although HR is considered by administrative theory to be a strategic function for every organization, strategic planning is not a priority for the US public sector HR units. Only 40% have a strategic plan for HR, while 60% haven’t. The reason for the lack of strategic planning could be either that the public agency’s leadership doesn’t consider HR aspects as significant factors for organizational performance or that the HR unit is understaffed and under pressure to fulfil day-to-day operations so strategic planning becomes unfeasible. For those agencies that have an existing strategic plan, 97% regard recruiting and staffing as the main strategic elements.

4.1.3. Attracting the right people
According to the IPMA-HR study, sound recruiting and staffing involves identifying and attracting the right people to fill all kind of public positions from entry-level personnel to the top management decision-makers in a cost-effective and timely way. Finding the right person for each position is a challenge for any organization, and seems to be particularly hard for public agencies. Research indicates that antagonism with the private sector for performing staff is growing and that the capacity to offer more attractive compensation and incentive packages is a critical advantage for the private sector. Public organizations compete for qualified professionals not only with
private firms, but also with other agencies. Such kind of difficulties obliged public sector organizations to develop flexible recruiting policies like shifting temporary workers to permanent employees, developing a branding strategy and improving their visibility through messaging and marketing, using professional networks to reach specialized staff etc. Gathering data and measuring performance permit the use of unconventional staffing methods like shared services and outsourcing. Information technology (IT) facilitates flexible recruiting methods but the study concludes that, even in the US, the use of IT applications for staffing purposes remains poor in the public sector.

4.1.4. Branding the public agencies as employers of choice

IPMA-HR believes that demographic data on public employment show that US public agencies in the near future will be faced with increasing vacancies and shrinking applicant pools. In many cases, seem to employ candidates rejected by the private sector. Under such conditions public organizations need to build up innovative strategies in order to become attractive employers as the have to compete for staff with the private sector and with each other. Public agencies in the US are recently starting to acknowledge the significance of reputation or how the organization is seen through the eyes of citizens and potential employees. Usually related with the private sector and sales, branding is a new idea in the public sector. A successful branding strategy requires defining what differentiates a given agency from others. From a HR point of view branding is about managing and improving organizational reputation as an employer,
defining the benefits of working in the agency and communicating these features to potential employees.

Only 25% of the assessed agencies have established an employer branding strategy and define the following factors as its key components:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Feature</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Great place to work</td>
<td>76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Excellent benefits</td>
<td>70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pride/value in helping people and service the community</td>
<td>68%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunities for professional development</td>
<td>68%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pride/value of working in public service</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunities for advancement</td>
<td>51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job security</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Innovative approach or work environment</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Public agencies in the US seem to recognize the fact that they cannot beat the private sector in terms of compensation and try to promote motivating factors specific to the public sector including pride and job satisfaction as well as opportunities for professional development. The public sector can also attract less experienced professionals by offering advancement opportunities or the possibility to work on a multitude of projects.
4.1.5. The temporary workforce in the public sector
Public sector organizations often use temporary employees to cover pressing obligations. Temporary employees can be speedily engaged on both a short-term basis with (e.g. a four month assignment) or without a pre-defined employment period (indefinite assignment) and, as a rule, they don't have the benefits offered to permanent employees. Temporary employees seem to be a considerable part of the US public sector workforce. 78% of the assessed agencies state that 1% to 25% of their workforce is employed on a temporary basis, while 22% report between 26% and 60%, and 10% report 51 to 75%. Frequently, temporary employees are offered chances to become permanent. 77% of assessed agencies point out that between 1 and 25% of temporary staff eventually become permanent, while only 12% report that temporary workers never get permanent employment. The process for converting temporary staff to permanent positions is for the most part informal. Only 25% of the assessed agencies apply a formal process. Internships also permit public agencies to hire staff still in training, making possible a softer transition towards a permanent position. Interns often transfer important experience and organizational knowledge collected during the internship to their permanent position.

4.1.6. Measuring staffing procedure effectiveness
Performance measurement and the resulting data can help public organizations to evaluate HR strategies and in particular staffing methods. Precise data and trustworthy information, can also support organizational
demands for additional staff and funding while the lack of appropriate metrics undermines efforts for qualitative and quantitative analysis necessary for restructuring and performance improvement. Gathering accurate data is, then again, a very manual labour intensive job and this generates major difficulties for organizations lacking IT applications automatically producing quantitative reporting.

The IPMA-HR study classifies HR performance metrics either as proactive or reactive. Reactive metrics, in contrast, are the most common measurement tools used by public organizations and focus on collecting data about an incident after it happens, such as turnover or vacancies. These measures depict the current state of the organization in various areas, such as open positions or volume of applications. Proactive metrics provide a view of the performance specific HR processes or functions, but necessitate multiple calculations and analysis. Such metrics are “time to fill” e.g. the average time necessary to fill vacancy and “cost to fill” estimating the financial cost in order to fill a vacancy can help an organization weigh the efficiency of the staffing process. The study assessed that HR US public agencies utilize the following metrics:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Metrics</th>
<th>Frequency of use</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Voluntary turnover</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vacancy rate</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Volume of applications</td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Metrics that necessitate complicated calculation are less common. However, 52% of the assessed organizations indicate that HR performance measurement and benchmarking are included into their day-to-day practice. Metrics such as the number of qualified applicants (e.g. the size of the applicant pool) compared to vacancies, permit to understand if an organization can reach the appropriate candidates. US public agencies estimate a better size of the applicant pool for administrative positions that are easier to fill than the other categories since less skills or experience are necessary. The applicant pools for leadership and management positions are hardly adequate whereas applicant pools for specialists are even lower. Small applicant pools mean fewer candidates to choose from when filling vacancies. Stan Lepeak believes that public sector organizations could face long-term problems if they cannot ensure the quantity and quality of their applicant pool. If they low down their standards, they will possibly weaken their long-term organizational performance. Another option is to reduce their qualitative and quantitative staff requirements by improving process efficiency, increasing the automation of work so fewer employees are necessary to complete tasks and increase the
use of third party resources instead of permanent staff\textsuperscript{21}. Finally, 83\% of the surveyed agencies do not outsource\textsuperscript{22} any staffing functions, while 17 \% outsource for external staffing rather than internal. Drug testing is the most probable function to be outsourced.

4.1.7. Recruiting Procedures

Another study offering very interesting information on the specific staff recruiting procedures followed by the US public agencies is the one prepared jointly by the International Personnel Management Association and the National Association of State Personnel Executives in 2001\textsuperscript{23}. 177 federal, state and local agencies representing more than three million employees participated in this survey. The main findings and conclusions of this important, from a comparative point of view, study are the following:

4.1.7.1. Applicant Testing

The most commonly used testing methods are: (a) written tests for job knowledge, (b) training and experience evaluations and (c) oral exams. The following table summarizes all applied methods and their relevant percentages\textsuperscript{24}:

\textsuperscript{22} Outsourcing means that specific organizational functions are delivered by external service providers.
\textsuperscript{24} Percentages add up to more than 100\% because respondents were asked to select all methods that apply in their case.
1. **All types of staff**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Testing methods</th>
<th>Most frequently used</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Written tests for job knowledge</td>
<td>81 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training/experience evaluations</td>
<td>70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oral exams</td>
<td>70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resume screens</td>
<td>66%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criminal record checks for certain jobs only</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-employment drug tests for certain jobs only</td>
<td>53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessment Centres</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written General Aptitude Tests</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skills inventories</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-employment drug tests for all jobs</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criminal record checks for all jobs</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personality tests</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skills inventories</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computerized written exams</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical ability tests, typing and data entry tests, video-based testing</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>for public safety, and job simulations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The relation between testing methods and high performers recruitment calculated by using evaluation data of employee performance is the following:
2. High performing staff

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Testing methods</th>
<th>Most frequently used</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oral exams</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training and experience evaluations</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resume screens</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above results show that while written tests are the most frequently used method for general staff when it comes to recruit the best performers, oral exams become number one, whereas experience evaluations and resume screens seem more important than written tests.

The most common testing methods classified by professional category and comparatively ranked both by frequency of use and by estimation of effectiveness are the following:

3. Labour and Maintenance Positions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Testing methods</th>
<th>Most frequently used</th>
<th>Most effective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-employment drug testing</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training/experience evaluations</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oral exams</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### 4. Skilled Occupations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Testing methods</th>
<th>Most frequently used</th>
<th>Most effective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Training/experience evaluations</td>
<td>60 %</td>
<td>58 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-employment drug testing</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oral Exams</td>
<td>47 %</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written test for job knowledge</td>
<td>43 %</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resume screens</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 5. Clerical Positions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Testing methods</th>
<th>Most frequently used</th>
<th>Most effective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Written tests for job knowledge</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>48%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training/Experience evaluations</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oral Exams</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 6. Public Safety Positions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Testing methods</th>
<th>Most frequently used</th>
<th>Most effective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Criminal record checks</td>
<td>89 %</td>
<td>62 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-employment drug testing</td>
<td>84 %</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oral Exams</td>
<td>73 %</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written tests for job knowledge</td>
<td>72 %</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
7. Professional Positions (without information technology positions)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Testing methods</th>
<th>Most frequently used</th>
<th>Most effective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Training/experience evaluations</td>
<td>67 %</td>
<td>59 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resume screens</td>
<td>67 %</td>
<td>55 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oral Exams</td>
<td>63 %</td>
<td>59 %</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8. Information Technology Positions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Testing methods</th>
<th>Most frequently used</th>
<th>Most effective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Training/experience evaluations</td>
<td>64 %</td>
<td>59 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resume screens</td>
<td>63 %</td>
<td>54 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oral Exams</td>
<td>56 %</td>
<td>49 %</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

9. Supervisory Positions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Testing methods</th>
<th>Most frequently used</th>
<th>Most effective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Training/experience evaluations</td>
<td>71 %</td>
<td>61 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oral Exams</td>
<td>63 %</td>
<td>64 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resume screens</td>
<td>62 %</td>
<td>49 %</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

10. Middle Management Positions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Testing methods</th>
<th>Most frequently used</th>
<th>Most effective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Training/experience evaluations</td>
<td>68 %</td>
<td>54 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resume screens</td>
<td>66 %</td>
<td>53 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oral Exams</td>
<td>65 %</td>
<td>59 %</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
11. Senior Executive Positions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Testing methods</th>
<th>Most frequently used</th>
<th>Most effective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Resume screens</td>
<td>71 %</td>
<td>57 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oral Exams</td>
<td>61 %</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training/experience evaluations</td>
<td>55 %</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.1.7.2. Recruiting Process Duration

65% of the respondents will complete under the best conditions the recruiting process in not more than 30 days. Best conditions regard the availability of decision-makers and the availability of a list of qualified candidates. The process is slower when there is no list of qualified candidates available. 41% of respondents will finish the recruiting process in less than 30 days while 75% of respondents will finish the process in less than 60 days.

4.1.7.3. Posting Vacancies

40% of respondents mentioned that they post vacancies for internal applicants before publicly announcing them.

4.1.7.4. Outsourcing

The only function habitually carried out by external service providers is drug testing. Development of knowledge and skills tests as well as assessment tools, is also occasionally outsourced, while processing applications and interviewing candidates are usually handled in-house.
4.1.7.5. Provisional Recruitment

Approximately 33% of the assessed agencies have the possibility to recruit on a provisional basis before they formally finalize testing and selection of candidates.

4.1.7.6. Probationary Periods

99% of the respondents said they apply probationary periods for newly recruited staff. Usually, a probationary period lasts 4-6 months. However, for certain positions, such as public safety jobs and senior managers, the period can reach 7-12 months. Very few jobs require probationary periods longer than 12 months. 91% of assessed agencies carry out performance evaluation of the newly recruited during or at the closing stages of the probationary period.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Performance evaluation period</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>At the end of the probationary period</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At the mid-point of the probationary period</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More frequently</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

89% of the assessed agencies said that they provide training to assist probationary staff with lack of knowledge or skills and poor performance.

Terminations during probationary periods are rare. Agencies usually do not fire and employees do not quit voluntarily their job during the probation. 65% of respondents indicate that less than 2% newly recruited staff gets fired while 75% said that fewer than 2% of staff quit.
4.1.7.7. Diversity Recruitment

The majority of assessed agencies reported setting and meeting affirmative action for diversity recruitment goals (e.g. preferential recruitment for women, cultural/linguistic minorities, handicapped persons etc.).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Diversity Recruitment</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Very great success</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Great success</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderate success</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small success</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No success</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Diversity Recruitment goals</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.1.7.8. Recruitment through Internet

58% of assessed agencies reported accepting electronically applications and relevant supporting materials, while 42% do not.

4.1.7.9. Cost per Recruitment

Only 5% of assessed agencies indicated that they estimate cost per recruitment and, from them only 2% produce data on average cost per hire by occupational group.

4.1.8 Potential Improvement Areas

The Merit Systems Protection Board is a US federal agency successor to the Civil Service Commission, with a strategic role in federal HR management.
MSPB’s mission is to promote the implementation of the merit system through mediation, public sector-wide studies and regulatory reviews. MSPB prepared an analysis of the current staffing system in the American public sector focusing on potential improvement areas with the following conclusions:

The philosophy of the current US recruiting system and the related practices promotes staffing flexibility through deregulation, decentralization and delegation, the use of alternative HR systems and efforts for reducing recruitment time as well as eliminating procedural barriers.

The negative aspects of such orientation according to MSPB are the inexistence of a unified recruitment system, varying assessment methods and varying results, limited economies of scale, confusing processes for candidates and the increase of a feeling of unfairness for potential applicants. More precisely vacancy announcements are often poorly written and confusing, the technical competence of the federal examining offices varies and resources are often limited, while employees are uncertain of the fairness of the recruiting process. In general extreme complexity can accentuate process over substance, turn away attention from assessment and undercut perceptions of fairness.

MSPB recommends a series of measures in order to ameliorate the existing recruitment system. The table that follows compares the main features of the existing and the improved staffing models.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Actions</th>
<th>The Typical Federal Recruitment Process</th>
<th>The Improved Process</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Announce</td>
<td>Public notice required in most, but not all, cases</td>
<td>Use plain language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Announcements are detailed and lengthy</td>
<td>Use technology effectively</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Aim for “transparency”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Receive Applications</td>
<td>• No standard application form</td>
<td>• Standardize format of “core” documents (e.g., resume)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Agency may require</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• substantial documentation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rate and Rank</td>
<td>• Most common method:</td>
<td>• Use competency-based standards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• training and experience (T&amp;E)</td>
<td>• Use “multiple hurdles” to balance thoroughness, cost, and applicant burden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Initial rating based on meeting education and experience requirements</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Ranking based on KSAs -</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• questionnaire, narrative, or automated text analysis</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### 4.2. The Australian Experience

According to a knowledge framework for effective implementation of recruitment system developed by the Australian public training and information services, the following guidelines were identified:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Refer</th>
<th>Select</th>
<th>Evaluate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • Referral rules depend on recruiting authority  
  • Public policy may require priority referral of certain candidates | • Assessment (e.g., interview) for selection only, not ranking  
  • Extent and rigor of assessment varies | • Poor or inexistent evaluation procedures |
| Use category rating (score banding) to give weight to subsequent assessment(s) | • Give managers real authority and responsibility  
  • Use rigorous assessments  
  • Permit linkage between recruitment and selection  
  • Make timely decisions | • Rigorous probationary period  
  • Systematic measurement of process and results |

---

**Table:**

- **Refer:** Referral rules depend on recruiting authority. Public policy may require priority referral of certain candidates. Use category rating (score banding) to give weight to subsequent assessment(s).
- **Select:** Assessment (e.g., interview) for selection only, not ranking. Extent and rigor of assessment varies. Give managers real authority and responsibility. Use rigorous assessments. Permit linkage between recruitment and selection. Make timely decisions.
- **Evaluate:** Poor or inexistent evaluation procedures. Rigorous probationary period. Systematic measurement of process and results.
Service NTIS\textsuperscript{26}, the implementation of staffing policies overlaps in practice, with other organizational priorities such as compliance with legislation, ethical behaviour, diversity, workplace safety, etc. The main areas of staffing activities in the Australian civil service\textsuperscript{27}, as defined in the above-mentioned framework are the following:

4.2.1. Staffing process standardization

1. Advisory services on staffing policies and processes are provided for business unit managers in order to ensure compliance with methodological standards, relevant legislation and organisational requirements.

2. Job descriptions and selection criteria are developed to reflect both the general public sector standards and the desired competencies and behaviours in a given organisation.

3. Job vacancies and relevant recruitment information are broadly advertised.

\textsuperscript{26} National Training Information Service, Implement staffing policies, Training Package on Human Resource Management, PSP04.

4. A quality assurance function is embedded in all stages of the staffing procedure e.g. short-listing applicants, finalising the selection process etc. in order to ensure compliance with legislation, policy and organisational standards.

5. Staffing processes are monitored, appeals are handled through pre-defined and transparent processes, and improvement suggestions referred to HR managers.

6. Advice is provided on implementing, monitoring and evaluating probation periods, where they are pre-conditions of permanent employment.

7. Relevant tools:
   1. Indicative selection processes
      (a) Job analysis, (b) job design (c) job description evaluation and classification, (d) competency profiling, (e) benchmarking, (f) diversity targeting, (g) streamlining processes, (h) use of external agencies, (i) recruitment advertising, (j)application processing, (k) short-listing, (l) selection panel training, (m) selection panel formation (n) merit selection criteria, (o) interviews, (p) assessment centres, (q) psychometric assessment, (r) selection process reports, (s) appeals, (t) complaints procedures, (u) advertising selection outcomes (v) advising unsuccessful applicants.

   2. Indicative recruitment information
      (a) Organisation profile, (b) business unit profile (c) organisational /business unit structure, (d) job description (e) competency profiling, (f) description of the
recruitment process, (g) application guidelines, (h) selection criteria, (i) knowledge and skills tests and interview /panel makeup and process

3. Indicative legislation and policy content. 
(a) Supra-national (Commonwealth ) and State /Territory legislation including equal employment opportunity, anti-corruption, privacy and anti-discrimination laws, (b) national and international codes of practice and standards (c) government HR policy, (d) the organisation's policies and practices (e) codes of ethics and conduct.

4. Indicative monitoring areas. 
(a) Selection panel composition, (b) panel members trained in merit selection, (c) diversity of applicants, (d) duration of recruitment, (e) complaints in relation to recruitment and selection, (f) conflicts of interest.

4.2.2. New appointees' induction standardization

1. Induction objectives, content and methodology are standardized in accordance with organisational unit needs, HR policies and cost-benefit concerns

2. Feedback is obtained from the induction activities participants and line managers and used for the evaluation of the induction programs quality.

3. Improvements to the induction process and the relevant organisational policies are suggested in accordance with the received feedback.

4. Relevant tools:
1. Indicative induction content
(a) public sector values, (b) public sector ethics, (c) codes of conduct, (d) organisational policies and procedures, (e) public sector legislative requirements, (f) the organisation's enabling legislation, (g) organisational environment, culture, structure and protocols, (h) occupational health and safety related to working in the public sector, and (i) particular to the organisation, (j) environmental issues/requirements, (k) standard operating procedures, (l) equity and diversity, (m) delegations, (n) grievance procedures, (o) career management/progression, (p) learning and development.

2. Indicative induction methodology
(a) Indicative induction methodology, (b) face-to-face information sessions, (c) handouts, (d) organisational manuals, (e) intranet, (f) organisational tour, (g) shadowing, (h) mentoring, (i) supervision, (j) assessment, (k) probation.

3. Indicative induction delivery alternatives
(a) In-house delivery, (b) use of contractors, (c) methods and content specialist contribution, (e) guest speakers, (f) senior management contribution, (g) occupational health and safety experts' contribution.

4.2.3. Redeployment standardization
1. Redeployment policies and processes are standardized and communicated to staff.

2. Staff likely to be redeployed are consulted; their understanding of the process, their rights and responsibilities are standardized and their access to support, learning and development services and new job opportunities ensured.
3. Redeployment processes are monitored to test their effectiveness and corrections are suggested and implemented in accordance with line management advice.

4. Relevant tools:

   Indicative Redeployment Reasons
   
   (a) Analysis of changing organisational needs, (b) assessment of the loss of essential skills, (c) assessment of poor performance reasons, (d) plans for employees’ rehabilitation

4.2.4. Retention and separation standardization

1. Policies and procedures for the retention and separation of staff are standardized.

2. Separation documents are processed in line with general legislative and specific organizational requirements.

3. Staff voluntary asking for separation are encouraged to consider other solutions within a well planned organisational retention policy.

4. Exit interviews are conducted, data is analysed and used for the improvement of the organisational HR management policies and procedures.

5. Relevant tools:

   1. Indicative separation reasons assessment
   
   (a) Organisational restructuring or down-sizing, (b) voluntary termination e.g. resignation or retirement, (c) termination at the end of a contract period, (d)
retirement on medical grounds, (e) involuntary termination (e.g. dismissal for misconduct).

2. Indicative options other than separation
(a) Phased retirement, (b) flexible working hours, (c) part-time employment, (d) fractional employment, (e) working from home

4.2.5. Key Competencies standardization
The NTIS staffing knowledge framework proposes six areas of key competencies: (a) collect, analyse and organise information (b) communicate ideas and information (c) plan and organise activities (d) apply problem solving skills (e) use quantitative analysis and programming techniques (e) use technology (f) team work. Agencies applying the framework are invited to adapt each area of key competencies to their proper working environment by providing examples of specific applications and setting performance levels for each competency within every particular job description.

4.2.6. Skills, knowledge and behaviour requirements standardization
The selection panels or the responsible HR units assess evidence confirming that applicants have skills, knowledge and behaviour patterns indispensables for a given position’s competencies. Such evidence includes employment

---

28 On the importance of individual behaviour in organizational environments: Vigota-Gadot, Eran; Meirie, Sagie New Public Management Values and Person-Organization Fit: A Socio-Psychological Approach and Empirical Examination Among Public Sector Personnel, Public Administration, Volume 86, Number 1, March 2008, Pages: 111-131
contracts, awards, terms and conditions of previous employment, employee entitlements, employee recorded misconduct in the context of public sector employment, candidate’s capacity for understanding, analyzing and systematizing practical situations, interpreting and explaining formal documents and assisting colleagues, subordinates or the public to apply them in the workplace, coping with difficulties and irregularities, assuming effective negotiation and consultation, using a variety communication codes and channels to explain situations and ideas to different audiences, responding to diversity, including gender and disability, cooperating with other public agencies, managing external contractors, applying occupational health and safety procedures etc.

4.2.7. Standardization of resources required to perform applicants’ assessment

Resources needed in the context of implementing staffing procedures include legislation and policies such as human resource policies, equal employment opportunity, ethics, equity and diversity principles related to recruitment, merit selection, induction, redeployment and separation principles and processes, recruitment methods including Internet-based procedures, psychometric and skills testing, retention purposes and strategies, rehabilitation procedures, grievance/appeals procedures, alternatives to dismissal, concepts of redundancy, voluntary termination, dismissal and suspension, concepts of justice and procedural fairness, jurisdictional legislation applying to human resources including occupational health and safety and environment employee assistance programs, compensation schemes etc.
4.2.8. Standardization of assessment methods

Assessment methods should reflect concrete workplace demands, such as needs of the target groups as well as the specific requests of particular sub-groups, for instance people with disabilities, people from different cultural and linguistic environments (like Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people in the Australian case), women, young people and senior citizens, inhabitants of rural and remote areas etc. Suitable assessment may include screening of academic credentials, authenticated evidence from the previous employment and training courses, interviews and questioning, portfolios, projects, case studies and scenarios’ analysis, evidence from a workplace environment that replicates the agency’s and the specific position’s usual work practices as well as the different situations expected to be encountered when performing day-to-day work, etc.

4.3. The South African experience

The Public Service Commission of the Republic of South Africa prepared a Toolkit on Recruitment$^{29}$ reflecting the South African experience$^{30}$ on public service staffing and suggesting ways to ensure effective and accountable recruitment. The PSC has been involved over the recent years in several

---

$^{29}$ Public Service Commission, National Office, *A Toolkit on Recruitment and Selection*, Republic of South Africa

$^{30}$ See also Westhuizen der E. J.; Wessels, van, J. S. (2005), *South African Human Resource Management for the Public Sector*, Juta Academic
investigations of the recruitment procedures in the South African public service. The main findings of this research are the following:

Departments generally do not have appropriate policies and procedures in order to ensure the objective, fair and consistent recruitment, do not have standardized methods and procedures to guarantee compliance with the constitutional and other legal requirements, do not set down values, principles and standards regulating HR management in the public service, do not systematically assess knowledge, skills and behaviour required from potential applicants, do not standardize and consistently apply selection criteria, do not document and record their recruiting assessments and decisions accurately and, last but not least, do not monitor and evaluate their proper functions in order to improve them.

The above shortcomings make the filling of vacancies remarkably slow, requiring in many cases up to nine months or even longer; screening and short-listing are faulty and do not generate the required outputs; selection procedures are inadequately structured while the Selection Committees’ members are frequently involved only at a very late stage of the recruiting procedure, not always provided with adequate records and data, often unfamiliar with the selection process and frequently lacking the essential interviewing and selecting skills.

From the preceding analysis becomes evident that the South African departments in order to recruit in a fair and transparent way need to systematically implement a HR management framework containing essential principles approved by legislation, elaborated departmental policies and strategies as well as relevant enabling tools. Such a framework should include the elements that are enumerated below

4.3.1 Vacancy Advertisement

The recruitment process, as a rule, starts with the publication of a vacancy advertisement. The objective of an advertisement is to contact the widest possible group of appropriate candidates within a distinctive professional area. There is no reason to announce a vacancy to people who lack the knowledge and skills necessary to perform a specific job. Hence, it is essential in order to reduce non-qualifying applications, that an advertisement clearly defines the requirements that must be met by applicants. If these requirements are not met, there is no obligation on the recruiting agency to consider such applications.

It must be ensured that the rule of equal competition is not violated. Therefore, a department or other public agency has to carefully analyse the formal and substantive requirements so one can perform the job, before it prepares the advertisement. In fact this is not often done and sometimes agencies realize very tardy that they have publicized inappropriate qualification requirements.
Putting aside such qualifications during an ongoing recruitment process is not permitted, since it compromises the equal access to such posts as far as potential candidates could not apply due to the specific requirements mentioned in the advertisement.

To ensure that the objectives of vacancy advertising are met, its language and style have to be simple and understandable; it should completely reflect the job content and give a clear indication of requirements. The advertisements must not be published through media which may exclude or disproportionately reduce certain categories of applicants, for instance a publication that is mostly followed by a specific group e.g. a male readership or certain religious or linguistic groups.

4.3.2 Applications' screening

Effective screening is the first step in removing applications that do not meet the recruitment criteria. This is done by applying to every request in a consistent way a predefined set of more general criteria as contained for example in the Public Service Act and more specific requirements in conformity with the job content, as described in the advertisement. The screening process is managed in an objective and open way and its various stages should be documented and put on record.

Specific criteria must be used for screening all candidates. Firstly, a closing date for applications clearly mentioned in the advertisement should be met. All
applications that are not in accordance with this closing date are disqualified. Certain conditions with reference to the content and form of application documentation should be also met. CV's and relevant documentation must be complete and clear on subjects emphasized in the advertisement, legible, dated and signed. Where these requirements are not met, applicants are disqualified. Recruiting agencies have to standardize the content and format of applications and supportive documentation. A standardized application format guarantees uniformity of actions and criteria and ensures easy monitoring, control and record-keeping. Minimum requirements should be met as well with regard to qualifications and competencies such as knowledge, skills and where necessitated, experience. In addition requirements should be met concerning citizenship, age and, in certain cases, health.

Screening as a rule is the responsibility of the agency’s HR management unit while the specific line units offering the job must be represented in the selection committee in order to ensure that the selection is processed in accordance with the criteria defined by them. If an official involved in the screening process is related, directly or indirectly, by kinship or friendship to any candidate he has to make an announcement of a conflict of interest and to withdraw from the selection process so as to avoid any impression of partiality or bias.

All applicants passing the screening test without meeting basic requirements are timely notified by a letter of regret containing a brief description of the reasons for unsuccessful screening. It is not recommended to state in the
vacancy’s advertisement that applicants who do not receive feedback within a specified time period should regard their applications as rejected. This reveals a negative impression of the recruiting agency and doesn't provide guarantees to applicants that their applications have being received a specific department has indeed.

All relevant information must be put on record given that the screening has a crucial impact on the rights and expectations of candidates, so the whole process should be accountable. Documentation to be put on record includes a copy of the advertisement, the application form, the finalized list of all applicants, a report of the screening process dully signed by all members of the screening panel, CVs, relevant documents, and a copy of the letter of regret where required, for each applicant.

4.3.3. Short-listing
Short-listing is the next phase of the recruitment process. During this phase criteria complimentary to that of screening are applied with a view to identify the most suitable candidates among the successfully screened ones. The main objective of short-listing is to rank candidates and to determine a limit level under which candidates will not be invited for interview in the final phase.

Screening generally assesses only the minimum formal requirements in regard to qualifications and competencies. Still, a recruiting agency can confer more importance to applicants that exceed the minimum prerequisites. As a result
the criteria utilised for short-listing purposes should be adequately specified and quantifiable in order to permit ranking.

The short-listing criteria should be clear, specific and related to the inherent requirements of a job. The main criteria are two. The first concerns the relevancy of qualifications and competencies to the nature of the job’s content while the second looks upon the level of such qualifications and competencies.

With the purpose of selecting the most suitable candidate a higher relevancy of academic and/or professional qualifications, appropriate skills and, where necessitated, experience must be considered as an additional promoting factor. The relevancy of qualifications and competencies depends on the specific technical and administrative requirements of the job content. Besides a higher level of relevant qualifications or formal professional knowledge and, where required, experience should be given more value for short-listing.

Short-listing should be conducted in an impartial and unbiased way. Checks and balances must be used to avoid that individual partiality and stereotyping. In this regard it is necessary to take care not to shortlist exclusively applicants similar in race, gender, age, and culture. This can, for example, be achieved by means of a selection committee consisting of persons of different race, gender, age and culture.
Contrary with screening short-listing requires a profound knowledge of the working details of the vacant post, so the specific line units offering the job need to be primarily involved in the procedure.

The utilisation of standardized forms has the same advantages as stated in the analysis of the screening process. Data gathered from application forms, CV’s and documentation should be used for ranking candidates by utilising a standardized scoring system, which should produce a comparable score for each applicant. A pragmatic limit level should then be agreed on to define a manageable group of candidates to be qualified for the final selection phase.

A letter of regret should be sent to all non qualified applicants summarizing the reasons for not being short-listed. All relevant information has to be documented and put on record.

4.3.4. Final selection
The final selection phase, aims at identifying the most fitting candidates amongst those short-listed. For final selection purposes one or more evaluation techniques (‘selection instrument’) can be utilised such as interviews, written tests, review of past accomplishments, reference-checking, psychometric testing and, on the whole, assessment centres. Interviews seem to be undoubtedly the most frequently used technique.

---

32 An Assessment Centre is a model a multidimensional evaluation of working/ organizational behaviour based on standardized job-related simulations, interviews, and psychological tests.
An applicant’s level of work performance, as demonstrated with regard to a specific area of work, determined in respect of knowledge, skills, expertise, experience, where required, as well as attitude and behaviour.

To determine the level of work performance, the core competencies or functions, should be analysed. Firstly the job’s core competency areas or functions should be deduced from the job description and should be further broken down into competency elements and competency issues. Each competency element must be assessed in terms of the relevant competency area and each competency issue must be assessed in terms of the relevant competency element. To be able to do this analysis, questions need to be developed for all the competency issues based on what kind of actions is required in respect of each one. Each competency issue needs to be scored and therefore a scale needs to be developed against which each competency issue can be assessed. Distinct levels of competency performance such as beginner, semi-competent, competent, semi-expert, expert, have to be defined with a brief description of what precisely is the expected performance at each level.

For each recruiting procedure a ‘selection instrument’, i.e. a particular synthesis of different assessment tools such as ability tests, personality questionnaires, interviews, written tests, reference-checking etc., must be selected or specifically designed to correspond to the job content requirements. The
instrument has to be quantified in order to allow the final selection panel to rank applicants by granting to each and every-one a specified and well established value in points against clear and unambiguous criteria. It is, therefore, absolutely necessary to include in the “selection instrument” a “scoring matrix” through which an individual competency profile can be depicted to facilitate both the final selection and the appointees' training and development program during the probation period.

Usually selection panels have less than an hour to form sufficient impressions about candidates and select the most suitable amongst them. This limited time used for the interview as such, should represent, however, a small part of the overall selection work. The panel members must carefully prepare the interview by studying the advertisement terms, the application form, CVs and related documentation of each candidate, the vacancy's job description, and the short-listing reports in order to pre-establish a profile of each interviewee. The selection interview must then focus on elucidating details and obtaining additional information on particular areas and to test the exactness of information contained in the written records. In addition panel members before commencing the selection process must be familiar with the selection instrument.

The objective of the interview is to find out if the applicants possess or can acquire in a logical period of time the knowledge, skills and professional behaviour necessary to perform the job in a satisfactory manner, so questions
should focus on this. Questioning uniformity should also be guaranteed and all interviewees should be essentially subjected to the same questions by the same committee.

The interview can be frightening to many applicants so interviewers should make efforts to create a relaxing atmosphere through informal discussion before entering the substantive part of the interview. Informal discussion should be covering only dispassionate matters such as the weather or sports while personal questions, such as those about marital status, children, family responsibilities, etc. can be perceived as prejudiced. Equilibrium between the right of the recruiting agency to obtain information and the applicant's right to confidentiality must be established. Interviewers must consider questions carefully in order to avoid potential offending connotations on cultural differences. For that reason issues about religion, sexual orientation, health or disability status must be avoided.

The synthesis of the individual scores of the different competencies forms the overall performance level that defines a given applicant's suitability for the job. It's not compulsory to get an identical ranking of candidates during the short-listing and the final selection. It may happen that a candidate ranked low in the shortlist manifest higher competencies during the interview. After the final ranking all applicants must be informed about the selection results while successful candidate/s in order to be appointed must submit a letter of acceptance.
Selection panellists should get engaged in the process during short-listing so they can obtain substantive information on the candidates helpful for the final selection phase. They have to be acquainted with the vacancy’s job description as advertised; to be comfortable with the selection instrument; and to be familiar with the short-listed candidates’ dossiers in details. Therefore panellists should be provided with the vacancy’s job description and advertisement, the application forms, the CVs and relevant documentation of all short-listed candidates, the reports of the screening and short-listing processes as well as details of the selection instrument.

All relevant information must be archived in a complete file, including a job description of the vacant post, the advertisement, application forms, CVs and documentation, the rankings of the screening, short-listing and final selection accompanied by a description of the screening and the short-listing criteria as well as the selection instrument.

According to the Public Service Commission, selection interviews in South African public service seem rather generic and superficial. As indicated from evaluation data analysis most interviews do not assess in details individual competencies due to the fact that selection panellists are not well-informed about the job contents of vacancies; do not prepare interviews methodically; do not organize questioning around the advertised job specifications; do not get sufficient training on interviewing techniques.
4.3.5. Recruitment process monitoring and auditing

The final suggestion coming from the South African experience is that the overall recruitment process must be carefully controlled. In order to make certain that the outcomes of the recruitment procedure will be conform to the applying legal standards and operational requirements evaluation actions must be embedded in all stages of the process. Monitoring and auditing are the main evaluation methods. Monitoring is a permanent control that takes place during the processing of a given activity. Auditing is the final legal and substantive evaluation that usually takes place at given periods following the completion of an overall process. While screening, short-listing and final selection for instance, specially designed checklists could be used to make sure that all necessary requirements are met. The recruitment process should be monitored and audit to make certain that recruitment objectives are met; the overall practice is rigorous and the recruiting agency cannot be contested in this respect; potential unprofessional conduct and negligence are discovered and remedied immediately; trustworthy information is collected and inputted into the agency’s HR planning and management; the new appointees’ training and developmental needs are assessed and tackled.
CONCLUSION

Recruitment is a strategic function for every public organization. It heavily influences not only HR management but all organizational performance aspects, to the extent that strategic, structural and procedural dimensions depend, at the bottom-line, on the available human capacities.

Successful recruitment entails first of all systematically and deliberatively developed HR strategies. As it happens in every management area the clarity of broader choices determines the adequacy of more specific options: the sort of competencies required as well as the management schemes adopted define the appropriate staffing and recruitment procedures.

European and American experience demonstrates a variety of recruiting methods. However despite the technicalities deriving from the particular HR management system followed (namely the career system and the job/employment system) and the potential implementing weaknesses and

limitations of each individual model, international practice offers evidence of a common interest for rigorous and trustworthy staffing and recruitment procedures based on the merit and the equal access principles.

On the contrary, social and political pressure oblige public agencies in many developing administrations to employ frequently people without the sufficient academic and professional qualifications necessary to perform their duties adequately. To remedy to such shortcomings less developed administrative systems must introduce efficient and transparent staffing methods which ensure equity, fairness and merit.

Consistent staffing implies attracting selecting and developing the right people to fill vacancies from the entry-level to the top management in an efficient and timely manner. Such a global process comprises, to begin with, a carefully designed recruiting method rooted in a job based assessment plus


standardization of knowledge, skills, and professional behaviour constraints. Competency requirements definition will permit then the launching of a multipart process composed by five stages, namely advertising of the vacancy, receiving applications, screening the candidates, short-listing the successfully screened amongst them and processing the final selection that leads to the appointment of the highly ranked. An optional but always useful probation period permits to verify the appointees' capacities as well as their adaptability to the real working environment.

Reliable recruitment systems\textsuperscript{36} imply institutionalization of selection bodies, standardization of methodology and effective management of the resources required to perform assessment, ranking and final selection of applicants at all levels. Elaborated selection instruments and panellists that are familiar with the overall process and possess the essential interviewing and selecting skills\textsuperscript{37} are needed for performing recruiting mechanisms.

Recruitment must be linked to the continuous improvement of public employees' knowledge, skills and working attitudes, following the constant evolution of performance prerequisites and organizational needs. Such a


capacity enhancement can be achieved through diverse actions including vocational training, on the job learning, coaching and rotations.

The running of recruitment and selection should be systematically documented, monitored and evaluated permitting input to improve not only the recruiting process per se but also the overall staffing and HR management.

Similar principles and practices must apply to all staffing functions including induction programs, redeployment procedures, learning and development management, retention and separation policies etc. These complementary and inter-dependent stages must be deployed, processed, and controlled in a well structured and standardized manner.

Experience from developed administrative systems illustrates the fact that well-organized and successful staffing is not easily achievable. A critical condition for administrative performance and effective policy-making, staffing represents a very demanding issue that needs both a clear strategy and consistent implementing efforts for quality results and permanent improvement.
SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY


Bartram, Timothy; Stanton, Pauline, (2007), Developing the professional workforce: a focus on systems not individuals, International Journal of Human Resources Development and Management, Volume 7, Number 2, 19 March 2007, Pages:161-176

Beattie, Rona S ; Osborne, Stephen P., (Edit.), (2007), Human Resource Management in the Public Sector, Routledge


Cardona F. (1998), Structural Elements for Recruitment in European Civil Service Systems, SIGMA


Committee of Experts on Public Administration (2003), Strategies for high-quality staffing in the public sector, United Nations


Davidson G., Lepeak S., Newman E., (2007), Recruiting and Staffing in the Public Sector: Results from the IPMA-HR Research Series, International Public Management Association for Human Resources

Donovan, Craig; Garnett, James, (2006), Internships and the State Government Human Resources Crisis, International Journal of Public Administration, Volume 29, Number 9, Pages: 701-717


Gardner, Margaret (Edit.), (1993), Human Resource Management and Industrial Relations in the Public Sector, Macmillan


Hays, Steven, (1992), Personnel Management in the Public Sector, William C Brown Publications


Maor, Moshe; Stevens, Handley, (1997), Measuring the Impact of New Public Management and European Integration on Recruitment and Training in the UK Civil Service, Public Administration, Volume 75, Number 3, Autumn 1997 , Pages: 531-551


National Training Information Service, Implement staffing policies, Training Package on Human Resource Management, PSP04

Oswick C.; Grant D. (1996), Personnel management in the public sector Power, roles and relationships, Personnel Review, Volume 25, Number 2, Pages: 4-18


Public Service Commission, National Office, A Toolkit on Recruitment and Selection, Republic of South Africa


Robinson-Hickman, Gill, (2000), Managing Human Resources In The Public Sector , Wadsworth Publishing


Vigota-Gadot, Eran; Meirie, Sagie New Public Management Values and Person-Organization Fit: A Socio-Psychological Approach and Empirical
Examination Among Public Sector Personnel, Public Administration, Volume 86, Number 1, March 2008, Pages: 111-131

U.S. Merit Systems Protection Board, Office of Policy and Evaluation, Public Sector Staffing: Beyond Faster and Cheaper, Presentation to the IPMA-HR Assessment Council Annual, Conference, June 22, 2004

Westhuizen der E. J. ; Wessels, van, J. S. (2005), South African Human Resource Management for the Public Sector, Juta Academic


Internet Sources:

OSCE -Legislationline, available at www.legislationline.org,

The European Union – Information on the Structure of the civil and Public service of the EU Member States and Applicant States (2005), available at www.eupan.org/cms/repository/document/05_DG_EVENT_9June05_StructureCivilServices_en.pdf